

# Review of Education, Pedagogy, and Cultural Studies



ISSN: (Print) (Online) Journal homepage: https://www.tandfonline.com/loi/gred20

# Celebrating the "Aha" moments of ethnic studies: Using *Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy* to highlight practices of healing and wellness

Shiv R. Desai, Andrea "Dre" Abeita & Myrella R. Gonzalez

**To cite this article:** Shiv R. Desai, Andrea "Dre" Abeita & Myrella R. Gonzalez (2023) Celebrating the "Aha" moments of ethnic studies: Using *Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy* to highlight practices of healing and wellness, Review of Education, Pedagogy, and Cultural Studies, 45:2, 171-193, DOI: 10.1080/10714413.2021.1959211

To link to this article: <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/10714413.2021.1959211">https://doi.org/10.1080/10714413.2021.1959211</a>







# Celebrating the "Aha" moments of ethnic studies: Using *Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy* to highlight practices of healing and wellness

Shiv R. Desai, Andrea "Dre" Abeita, and Myrella R. Gonzalez

#### Introduction

Due to our current COVID-19 reality and the protests supporting the #BlackLivesMatter Movement following the killings of Ahmaud Arbery, Breonna Taylor, and George Floyd, seeking diversified and innovative educational solutions like ethnic studies (ES) and adapting to the everchanging needs of our students by creating supportive healing spaces of learning are more important than ever. These events have resulted in demands for educational systems that have the potential to address the wounds of racial violence that marginalized students have faced for centuries. More importantly, in light of the current environment, educational institutions must collaborate with their communities to provide teachers with culturally and community responsive strategies, trainings, and resources that promote healing and wellness.

The purpose of this paper is to celebrate the classroom victories of these ES teachers and explore the ways that they connect their curriculum and learning experiences to their students' lived realities. These ES teachers utilize holistic pedagogies that help their students move toward social change while cultivating the spiritual well-being of their students. Using the framework *Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy*<sup>1</sup> (Desai et al., 2019), our findings discuss the five major categories that emerged: (1) connecting the past to the present, (2) privileging identity, (3) addressing everyday struggles, (4) classroom rituals, and (5) social action. Amidst a global pandemic, social unrest, and the struggle to achieve social justice within broader society, we seek to highlight how these practices can be road maps for humanizing educational change.

#### Literature review

ES has a long, rich tradition of privileging the epistemologies, experiences, and cultures of marginalized groups, fostering humanizing practices, and inspiring community centered activism, all while centering the study of

race to address and contextualize our complex lived experiences (Buenavista, 2016; Grosfoguel, 2012; Salinas, 2011; Watson-Vandiver & Wiggan, 2018). More importantly, research from across the nation demonstrates that ES can tremendously improve academic achievement for students, especially among low-income students of color (Cabrera et al., 2014; de los Ríos et al., 2015; Dee & Penner, 2017; Kim, 2013; Sleeter, 2011; Tintiangco-Cubales et al., 2015). ES can also promote social justice pedagogical practices that can reduce racial and ethnic minority opportunity gaps (Cabrera et al., 2014; Sleeter, 2011), empower students, develop their civic leadership skills, and (re)affirm their racial/ethnic identity (Cabrera et al., 2013; Dee & Penner, 2017).

#### Impact of ethnic studies on student success

Sleeter (2011) conducted a comprehensive report for the National Education Association (NEA) on ES and found that it had positive outcomes for both students of color and white students. ES curriculum can potentially help to increase academic achievement, engagement, and social empowerment, especially for marginalized students. Cabrera et al (2014) stated, "Taking [Mexican American Studies] classes is consistently, significantly, and positively related to increased student academic achievement, and this relationship grows stronger the more classes students take" (p. 1107). Dee and Penner (2017) found that students who took an ES class, not only made significant gains in attendance and grades, but also increased course credits earned to graduate. More importantly, their findings showcased positive outcomes across male and female student populations, as well as with Asian and Latinx students. Additionally, similar to Cabrera et al. (2014), Dee and Penner (2017) also found increased significant gains in math and science GPAs for students who took ES courses. Overall, the overwhelming positive outcomes from utilizing an ES curriculum is proving to be invaluable, especially for marginalized students.

### Ethnic studies in K-12 settings

Buenavista (2016) stated, "The contemporary K-12 Ethnic Studies movement is the result of grassroots organizing by critical educators who consider ethnic studies an important mechanism to empower students and communities" (p. xv). This grassroots action was spurred by the seven-year court battle over Arizona House Bill (AZ HB 2281), which criminalized and attempted to dismantle and ban the Mexican American/Raza Studies Department (MARSD) in the Tucson Unified School District (TUSD) (Buenavista, 2016; Cabrera et al., 2014; Hoang, 2012). Ultimately in 2017,

U.S. District Judge Wallace Tashima, ruled that "both enactment and enforcement [of the ban] were motivated by racial animus" (Depenbrock, 2017) highlighting the political and racial motivations behind the ban.

Following the political backlash from Arizona, ethnic studies gained additional victories in key states like California, Oregon and Texas. For example, in California in both K-12 and higher education, support for ES has steadily grown. Since 2019, several districts in California including San Francisco, El Rancho, and Los Angeles, have all passed resolutions to make ES a high school graduation requirement (Borrero, 2019). In September 2020, California Governor Newsom vetoed a K-12 ES requirement stating that more work was needed in developing curriculum. Six months later, in March of 2021, the California State Board of Education approved the almost 900-page voluntary ethnic studies K-12 curriculum (Asmelash, 2021). Additionally, in August of 2020, Newsom signed Assembly Bill 1460 which requires all students enrolled at any of the 23 CSU campuses to complete a 3-unit ethnic studies course as a graduation requirement (Smith, 2020).

Likewise, in Oregon, legislators signed House Bill 2845 that will require adding ES to the K-12 curriculum for all its schools by 2021. Meanwhile, Indiana approved Senate Bill 337, requiring all high schools to offer an ES course as an elective each year (Alejo & Lara, 2018). Additionally, although usually not known for their use of race-based curriculum, in 2018 the Texas State Board of Education approved the use of Mexican American Studies and more recently in April of 2020, they unanimously approved the creation of an African American Studies course (Korte, 2020). Clearly across the nation, ES has been gaining influence and now is the time for a national implementation of ES in K-12 education.

# Ethnic studies as humanizing pedagogy

Tintiangco-Cubales et al. (2015) stated that there are four main traits of ES pedagogy: (1) a dedication to decolonization, (2) privileges culturally responsive pedagogy, (3) honors student lived experiences via community responsive practices that focus on working with families and communities, and (4) affirms positive racial/ethnic identity formation. In addition, Acosta (2007) discusses how Raza Studies, a type of ES pedagogy, uses love as a guiding principle to understand students and their lived experiences. Moreover, this pedagogical love encompasses a form of care that acknowledges students' barriers while embracing and problematizing their experiences, honoring their identities and encouraging them to draw on their strengths. As Acosta's work testifies, at the center of this newly created community-based love is a dignifying respect for students, their ideas,

experiences and cultures that helps to transform classroom spaces into communities capable of social action.

Building on Raza Studies pedagogy, Romero et al. (2009) described the critically compassionate model of transformative education (CCI). CCI is a co-constructed model created by students who participated in the Social Justice Education Project (SJEP). Informed by critical race theory and educational praxis, it has three main components which consist of curriculum, pedagogy, and student-teacher-parent interactions. This pedagogy centered the lived experiences of participants and was used to analyze examples of racism and violence. It facilitated the process of co-constructing a course that empowered students by fostering cultural intuition and learning while encouraging teachers to create spaces of authentic care. This process was guided by the Indigenous epistemology known as Xinachtli, a concept that validates and appreciates the value of a student's lived experiences.

Cammarota and Romero (2014) further expanded CCI by presenting a humanizing pedagogy that integrates Indigenous theory to foster resiliency in the classroom. Likewise, the four compañeros framework also known as the four Tezcatlipocas, guides educators in the use of Aztec concepts through processes of self-reflections, historical understanding, beautiful knowledge (critical consciousness), rejuvenation/transformation, and the embodiment of change through reflection (Arce, 2016; Cammarota & Romero, 2009). The integration of these concepts rehumanize us all by acknowledging the value of students' lived experiences and helps to foster critical analysis and further understanding. By creating understanding that our lived realities are the results of human action and historical events, students are able to transform their newly gained ES knowledge into social action. This process can empower and inspire students to make positive impacts on their communities as they transform from formerly passive banking recipients of knowledge to critical thinkers who are engaged in the creation of their own destinies (Freire, 2000).

Several researchers have noted ES students describing the classroom space as a "home" where their complex and intersecting identities were "accepted," and that the "safe" classroom environment was contingent on situating student identities with sociopolitical contexts and encouraging student reflection through culturally relevant classroom activities. These practices made students feel a sense of acceptance and encouraged them to embrace their marginalized identities through critical transformation and self-love (Acosta, 2014; Cammarota & Romero, 2009; de los Ríos, 2013, 2017). These studies offer a glimpse into the potential for ES classrooms to be used as spaces of healing and wellness. We argue that by engaging in practices of healing and wellness, centering students' cultures, identities, voices, and by connecting curriculum to their lived experiences, our



students will continue to make educational gains despite our ever-changing current COVID-19 reality.

#### **Framework**

This study utilized Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy, which is defined "as a soulful and living pedagogical framework wherein teaching, learning, and knowing take root within body/spirit/land epistemologies of resistance, resilience, and wholeness" (Desai et al., 2019). This framework promotes a decolonizing pedagogy that centers the complex lived realities, intersectional identities, contested bodies, intellectual legacies, spiritualities, and ancestral healing practices of communities of color to bring about social and educational equity (Sosa-Provencia et al., 2018). The six tenets of Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy include (1) constructs education politically, (2) enacts schooling as decolonization/empowerment, (3) centers epistemologies as multiliteracies of marginalized groups, (4) fosters critical frameworks for navigating oppression, (5) engages social action pedagogy, and (6) engenders hope and well-being. These six tenets are bound by a spiritual essence that is inextricably connected to the land and the ancestral spirits. This knowledge influences and informs modern acts of resistance and fosters resiliency and survivance (Vizenor, 2008) in the face of genocide, colonization, and imperialism. Furthermore, as a liberating and empowering framework, it can be used to work toward developing students' critical consciousness, while building on culturally relevant, sustaining, and revitalizing pedagogies (Ladson-Billings, 2014; McCarty & Lee, 2014; Paris & Alim, 2014).

Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy demands that educators be active agents of change who build on community perspectives while engaging youth to advocate for their communities. Within this context, teachers aim to create a reciprocal relationship with their students and community to promote spiritual/soulful hopefulness and a loving and supportive learning environment that can inspire social action. By utilizing the rich, varied traditions, beliefs and lived experiences of their students, teachers can help them navigate and analyze different interlocking systems of oppression through various critical lenses. Ultimately, by developing various skills and engaging in critical inquiry, teachers provide different pathways for their students to engage in social action beyond the classroom.

Tenet six highlights practices that engender hope and well-being. We argue that the multiple ES classroom practices of healing and wellness that were utilized in this study are in direct alignment with this framework and help to showcase how the educational process can lead to transformational social action. We define wellness as including any holistic interactions that

are rooted in "physical, mental, emotional, and spiritual ways of knowing" (Oropeza, 2002). Tenet six also draws upon the work of Shawn Secatero, Navajo elder and scholar, whose *Medicinal Well-Being* (2015) model illuminates an Indigenous healing process to restore, reclaim, and reconnect with spiritual, mental, physical and social well-being. In addition, tenet six centers survivance which Vizenor (2008) defines as a spectrum of coping responses Indigenous people(s) have developed amid imperialist genocide and forced assimilation. For the progeny of ancestors who faced incredible, undefinable horrors, we must remember that we exist today because our ancestors had limitless hope and courage that we would find a way to revitalize and restore ancient knowledge, traditions, and culture. Most importantly, our ancestors actively pursued, dreamed and created new possibilities that regenerated hope, and provided healing and wellness amidst the historical trauma (Brave Heart, 1999) that ravaged BIPOC communities. Thus, Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy utilizes this mind/body/spirit interconnectedness as a source of strength and healing, while urging educators across positionalities to ground themselves within epistemologies of survivance.

# Methodology

# Case study

Stake (1995) outlined three types of case studies, intrinsic, instrumental, and collective. This study utilized the third category. A collective case study is defined as a holistic inquiry process used to examine a certain population, condition or phenomenon. Some defining characteristics include (1) having multiple layers of case analysis including being viewed as a single case and/or being viewed as a collection of cases, (2) having a common condition or characteristic, (3) are somewhat categorically related, and (4) maybe be members of a similar group or examples of a phenomenon (Stake, 1995).

Therefore, this collective case study investigated the lived experiences of 16 ES high school teachers from a variety of differing positionalities and highlights their individual classroom successes during the roll out of a district-wide policy to include ES as an elective at every high school. This collaborative research project was between an urban public school district made up of 21 high schools, with a combined total of over 84,000 students in K-12 and a large flagship state university in a racially diverse city in the Southwest.

Following Lightfoot's (1983) case study example, in which she studied six schools and then completed a cross-case analysis, likewise this case study has multiple layers of bounded cases (as cited in Merriam, 2009). First of

all, each teacher and their classroom are their own bounded cases with individual teacher interviews as the main source of data. The second set of bounded cases are the ES trainings with focus group interviews. With the third bounded case, being the cross-case analysis of the district as a whole. Using a collective case study can help to connect individual teaching experiences to the greater collective and highlight how policy implementation happens in real time (Merriam, 2009). Finally, as highlighted by Guba and Lincoln (1981) as a methodological tool, the "case study is best because it provides thick description, is grounded, is holistic, and lifelike, simplifies data to be considered by the reader, illustrates meaning, and can communicate tacit knowledge (as cited in Merriam, 2009, p. 49).

# Data collection and analysis

This manuscript focuses on data that was collected during the spring and summer terms of the 2018 academic year. The research team conducted four training sessions with participants as part of the official district-wide professional development plan. These ES focused trainings supported a new mandate issued by the district in which every public high school was required to create and launch an ES course for the following academic year. Due to this unique research collaboration, permission was given by the district to contact all the current and soon-to-be ES high school teachers. Out of 21 high schools, eight high schools were represented by the 21 teachers that participated in our trainings; of which, 16 teachers were then individually interviewed. Therefore, this study's two main sources of data were four post-training focus group interviews and a total of 16 individual interviews.

After each training, the teachers were invited to participate in a focus group interview that discussed the challenges and barriers of ES implementation, the training that they received, and their experiences with ES. The number of participants for each focus group interview ranged from four to six participants; with a variety of ES teaching experiences ranging from preparing to teach ES, to a few years of experience, and veteran ES teachers. The focus group interviews were voluntary and not every teacher participated. Each focus group interview was audio recorded, transcribed, and coded for analysis.

For the next stage of data collection, the participants from the focus group interviews were then contacted for follow-up interviews. Out of 21 training participants, a total of 16 teachers were individually interviewed. There were five male and 11 female participants. Eight of the 16 participants identified as white, while the other eight identified as racial/ethnic minorities (1-Native American, 1-African American, and 6-Latinx). These 16 teachers represented six of twenty-one high schools in the district.

Focus group interviews were conducted to gain teachers perspectives on the challenges and barriers of ES implementation, how the provided training could inform their pedagogy, and what potential ES held for their students. Semi-structured individual interviews were conducted with 16 participants. A qualitative script was created to ensure that all interviews used the same protocol. The purpose of these individual interviews was to gain greater insight into each teacher's own specific and unique ES experiences. Moreover, special attention was given to each ES teachers' identities, trainings, decolonizing pedagogies, and how they used their classrooms, curriculum and practices to promote healing and wellness with their students. Overall, some of the focus group interview and individual interview questions overlapped because of related themes such as identity, healing, wellness, and humanizing pedagogies. For example, in the focus group interview, we asked questions about the challenges of implementation, while in the individual interviews we asked about specific barriers at their schools and what they would envision a successful implementation of ES to look like at their school and in the district. Additionally, during the focus groups, we asked teachers what they thought the benefits of teaching ES were, while in the individual interviews we asked teachers to provide us with specific examples of how they promoted healing and wellness in the classroom. Both strategies worked well in tandem. The focus group interviews allowed for a rich group discussion that was influenced and informed by common experiences, whereas the individual interviews allowed for teachers to address some of the same topics but on a more personal level during a one-on-one conversation.

All data sources were examined using horizontalization, which allows for data to be examined and given equal weight and therefore equal value throughout the data analysis process (Merriam, 2009). This approach was used to promote greater equity and to center teachers' voices as they discussed their pedagogy and epistemologies in regards to ES. After being transcribed, edited, and uploaded, each interview was read and coded in Dedoose, an online qualitative data analysis software program, by three separate members of the research team. The first reviewer was the person that conducted the interview, with the second and third reviewers being a different researcher. During the first coding meeting, a general list of topics and emerging themes was proposed and discussed, which included definitions and/or examples of each code. For instance, we agreed to use the code wellness when examples such as positive student identity formation, the creation of safe classroom spaces and/or humanizing practices were mentioned. Two additional meetings were held to recalibrate the

researchers' understanding of the codes and to add additional codes as needed. Finally, inductive analysis and the constant comparative methods were utilized to systematically code data, develop categories, and address issues of connectedness (Huberman & Miles, 1998). While there were several themes that emerged from the data, for purposes of this paper, we focus on the following: healing, wellness, hope, trauma, lived experiences, pedagogy, agency, and community issues.

# Results and discussion: Centering healing strategies in the classroom

Due to the global COVID-19 pandemic and our current socio-political climate, teachers must be able to address a wide variety of issues that students are contending with in their daily lives. In our findings, we provide a glimpse into the ways in which ES teachers can support their students' lived realities and provide examples of potential classroom practices of healing and wellness that support, educate and empower students. These strategies varied depending on the individual teacher, years of teaching experience, the needs of their students, professional development in ES, and access to resources. However, despite a variety of differences, common threads existed in the classrooms including: (1) connecting the past to the present, (2) privileging identity, (3) addressing everyday struggles, (4) classroom rituals, and (5) social action. These teachers utilized frameworks like Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy, which potentially allows for students to become more engaged and active participants during the learning process. Curriculum like ES can help students to develop their own sense of agency over their own educational development and could potentially showcase how culturally relevant pedagogies can lead to classroom spaces that embrace practices of healing and wellness.

## Connecting the past to the present

You can't really talk about ethnic studies without talking about history. (Adrian<sup>2</sup>, Latino)

Brave Heart (1999) defined historic trauma as "a constellation of characteristics associated with massive cumulative group trauma across generations" (p. 289). In this section, we present examples of how ES teachers addressed issues of historic trauma by utilizing critical and Indigenous based pedagogies, practices, curriculum, and frameworks. These teachers showcased how classrooms can potentially act as direct interventions to help address issues of trauma. Other classroom examples illustrated how practices of healing and wellness can be incorporated in order to model a more holistic teaching approach. Moreover, these teachers demonstrated how they enacted tenet two of the *Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy* by utilizing their classroom spaces to highlight and teach decolonizing pedagogies.

The participants explained that making connections between the past and the present provided an impactful experience for their ES students. One example of how this occurred was when Jonathan, a Latino teacher, discussed Indian boarding schools and the "Kill the Indian to Save the Man" forced assimilation policy. He explained how many of his students were shocked and in disbelief that this policy even existed. Furthermore, he explained how they were baffled with the sheer number of Native American lives lost as a result of U.S. empire building. Jonathan stated, "[T]hey were like flabbergasted ... they said, 'Well, we knew they did stuff to the Native Americans but we didn't know it was like that." Jonathan then asked his students to reflect on how trauma can be "passed down from generation to generation." Through engaging ES curriculum and critical reflection, Jonathon's students were better able to contextualize Indigenous peoples' histories, the disparities that continue to impact Native American communities, and begin to problematize how historical trauma continues to affect society even today.

Additionally, Jonathan's unit on Indian boarding schools illustrated how *Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy* can be used to challenge false and dehumanizing dominant ideologies by teaching historical events through the lens of ES. Furthermore, arming students with critical theory, concepts, and through modeling alternative decolonizing practices, teachers can support and encourage youth empowerment *Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy* calls upon "educators to dismantle colonizing and neoliberal forces of schooling which engender impoverished understandings of knowing and merge the material realities of students' lives toward a knowing of spiritual/soulful hopefulness" (Sosa-Provencia et al., 2018, p. 7).

Units like the above example with Indian boarding schools showcased how ES curriculum has the potential to create deeper understanding of how history connects to the present. Other probing questions that were addressed included exploring the connection between policies like forced assimilation and the disparities that continue to impact Native American communities today. Additionally, using theoretical concepts like historical trauma can allow for students to become familiar with complex ideological tools. As noted by Brave Heart (1999), studying historical events like Indian boarding school experiences within the context of ES can allow for a deeper analysis of the history of U.S. colonization and of the forced assimilation of marginalized populations.

In other key examples, several teachers discussed the trauma of slavery and Jim Crow practices. They discussed how the ramifications of these practices continue to impact Black communities today. While slavery might have ended after the Civil War, several teachers discussed how it never really ended because it transformed into more modern forms of oppression like the prison-industrial complex. Moreover, Jim Crow practices existed for another 100 years after slavery, which created a set of policies that entrenched racist practices of housing, employment, voting, and education that continues to restrict the rights of African Americans even today (Hannah-Jones, 2019).

Rebecca, a white teacher, shared how her unit on criminal justice connected the current Black Lives Matter (BLM) Movement to the history of the Civil Rights Movement. She stated that she wanted students to see "how [it] is all [re-]manifesting today." The ES readings included Between the World and Me, and The Case for Reparations by Te-Nehisi Coates. It also included viewing I Am Not Your Negro a documentary on James Baldwin as well as discussing mass incarceration by viewing the documentary The Thirteenth. Throughout this unit, the class motto was that "you can't talk about today, without studying yesterday." By connecting these key texts and examining the larger issues impacting Black life, Rebecca was able to help illustrate the importance of the BLM movement. After completing the unit, her students came away with concrete examples and arguments on why legislative change is necessary to address mass incarceration. In this example, Rebecca embodied tenet four of the Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy by helping students access tools and examples to analyze the interlocking dynamics of power and oppression through modern and contemporary movements. By the same token, when teachers center mind/ body/spirit pedagogies in the classroom, they can help to disrupt the effects of historic trauma and replace fear and despair with hope and growth (Sosa-Provencia et al., 2018).

Perhaps, even more importantly, teachers provided various opportunities for students to learn about how marginalized communities resisted. Anna, a Black teacher, provided a powerful quote that describes survivance (Vizenor, 2008):

I want them to come away with the concept that they are the descendants of survivors, that they are not victims. If they have the blood of their ancestors running through their veins, they are achievers... people who have overcome all obstacles in order for them to sit in this classroom...people who gave up their lives...for them to have a right to vote ... they stand on the shoulders of giants. I want them to have a sense of respect for what has happened in the past and a sense of responsibility.

This is an extremely powerful lesson that Anna strived to provide for her students to feel connected to their ancestors. Similar to Tuck and Yang (2018) who wrote, "The pull toward working for justice can feel transhistorical, like you heard it whispered by ancestors or felt it transmitted back to you from a future-in-waiting" (p. 1). In short, just as historical trauma may have been passed down through generations, so has the desire to fight, resist and build a brighter future. Thus, like Anna's hope to inspire her students by learning about their ancestors, so too can teachers utilize ES curriculum and strategies to help empower their students to transform pain and suffering into joy and hope.

## **Privileging identity**

Identity is central to really anything that we teach, but it plays an especially important role in teaching ethnic studies because if one does not recognize their own identity...[then] one is not going to provide an authentic experience for the students in one's ethnic studies class. (Adrian)

One of the most common examples of ES teachers creating a safe space and encouraging youth to begin the process of healing and wellness was when they centered student identity in the classroom. For example, Monica, a Chicana teacher, had her students create codices, which are pre-Columbian books written in Nahuas in pictorial and/or alphabetic form. Codices were a strong part of the Mayan and the Aztec cultures. It is important to state that many codices were destroyed during Spanish colonization. Monica explained how she used the concept of codices to help her students create autobiographical life stories so that they could get to know each other and that this activity set the foundation for having a safe, caring classroom environment. In doing these assignments, she had hoped students would share their vulnerabilities, critically reflect on their common lived experiences, and grow into a community of learners. Through such activities, ES teachers stressed the importance of learning about their students' lived realities in order to engage and better support them while trying to create a safe space where students will feel more comfortable sharing their own tribulations.

In another example, Lisa, a white teacher, explained how she used art to do an identity project with her students. She discussed how in doing this project students engaged in "thought-provoking" conversations and how she hoped it empowered her students to explore multiple aspects of their identity in an artistic medium of their choice (i.e., painting, clay). In her first example, one student used soft clay to sculpt of a scarecrow-type person that represented their history with mental health. Lisa discussed how she hoped that in doing such creative projects her students would be more empowered to be openly expressive about their complex identities. Another student also used clay to create their own sculpture of "a person with the shoulders and a head that was cracked open ....[with] succulents in the top of the head... beautiful, kind of falling out, tumbling out of the head." Additionally, Lisa stated that this student wanted to show the beauty and

the richness of their own Mexican American culture against the backdrop of an anti-Mexican immigration reality.

Through these assignments, both Monica and Lisa build on tenet three of Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy by centering the epistemologies and multiliteracies of marginalized communities. While they did not specifically claim to be engaging in testimonio pedagogy (Reyes & Curry Rodríguez, 2012), these projects were a form of testimonios for students where they could embody and examine their experiences, hopes, fears, love, and anxieties while fostering resiliency and critical reflection. These assignments were built based on the students' community knowledge(s) and therefore were reflective of the student's own lived experiences. Several ES participants recognized the importance of cultivating pride in their students' identities as a key mechanism to "harness their own" selves in order to achieve healing and wellness within classroom spaces. Consequently, by investing significant time to learn about various cultures, traditions, and customs, these ES teachers created potential learning environments that fostered curiosity and promoted critical thinking while attempting to create safe spaces that would honor individual students' backgrounds. Building from Acosta's (2007) work on the potential for Raza Studies pedagogy combined with the concept of love as a guiding principle, we argue that projects like Lisa's and Monica's are a form of critical care that dismantles barriers between teachers and their students, while encouraging self-discovery through the students' cultural lenses instead of the hegemonic lens that is promoted in traditional classroom environments. Therefore, we argue that the implementation of ES practices such as those highlighted in this section, can potentially result in positive self-images and self-concepts that can contribute to the healthy well-being of all our students.

#### Addressing everyday struggles

I know when there's an ICE raid in our community. Every kid I teach will send me a text message. I'm not going to school today. ICE is outside. (Andrew, male, white)

We've had suicide attempts at [X High School] every single year that I've taught [here] ... and several successes. (Rebecca, female, white)

The kids here have been traumatized due to homelessness, poverty... I've had many kids that tell me one or [more] parent is incarcerated. (Monica, Chicana)

I think, during the #MeToo movement, we had so much of this conversation of like, "This is happening in Hollywood and this is happening in politics." Well, this is happening everyday in the hallways. (Susan, female, white)

From the fear of ICE agents waiting to deport loved ones, to students dealing with the aftermath of a suicide attempt, to simply not knowing where the next shelter will be, the quotes above illustrate how students are

experiencing various forms of trauma that impact their ability to graduate. More importantly, teachers are important actors in student wellness because they are often the first point of contact when it comes to identifying the everyday struggles students face. Hence, the first tenet of *Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy* asserts that teaching is a political act and that educators cannot afford to be influenced by the false ideologies of colorblindness and neutrality (Ladson-Billings, 2014). Understanding that teaching is a political act is empowering for educators. This tenet is vital for the promotion of practices of healing and wellness because teachers must be able to create a safe, critical space where their students' complex lived realities can be analyzed and interrogated. Like ES, the first tenet helps students interrogate power and privilege so that they can develop a keen understanding of their histories, communities, families, and local and global communities (Sosa-Provencia et al., 2018).

Another way in which tenet one of *Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy* is embodied in the ES classroom was through critical dialogues. As Lisa explained, "I think that part of healing and wellness and hope, part of that process comes down to awareness and listening." For Lisa, one of the key ingredients for promoting healing and wellness in the classroom was to create a safe space where critical dialogue can take place so that students can share their concerns. Additionally, various ES teachers in this study made concerted investments to create familial spaces in the classroom making this a clear priority for their teaching practices.

One of the chief methods that ES teachers employed for creating safe spaces was by having students engage in reflective or critical journaling. Anna used reflective journaling as one of her main ES learning practices. Some of her students described their current struggles with depression, sexual identity, anxiety, or other forms of trauma while sharing their experiences. She explained one scenario in which reflecting on their sexual identity through journaling allowed for one student to open a pathway to connecting them with supportive services and eventually opening up enough to share with their family. Tenet one of *Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy* explicitly states that the lives of our students are not politically neutral because they are struggling with issues of sexuality, gender, race, class, language, religion, and other forms of identity (Sosa-Provencia et al., 2018). Thus, this example exemplifies how facets of our students' identities are often shared with teachers when safe spaces are available to them. As Anna stated, "This job is just as much dealing with the emotion of the child as it is teaching them material."

In another example, Adrian, a Latino teacher, discussed how his student was affected by poverty and homelessness. At the age of 14, his student had found themselves homeless and walking down a major boulevard with their two younger siblings. Fortunately, an aunt was able to step in and

help. Adrian shared how this student was able to overcome harrowing obstacles and was able to maintain excellent grades and graduate a year early. Through this example, Adrian described the resiliency and resolve students have even when the "odds are stacked" against them. This student was able to thrive and succeed with the support of their teachers, family, and community. Adrian further stated, "It just amazes me that some teachers don't even know their students. It's like how can you even teach without knowing your students?" He marveled at the disconnect that some teachers can have by not being connected and aware of the lived realities of their students. Thus, an important step for many study participants was centering the lived experiences of their students and not being afraid to discuss their complex realities. Through this process, they attempted to build strong relationships with their students.

Erika, a white female teacher, explained why ES was so empowering for students and how it helped to foster a sense of community in the classroom:

So ethnic studies also provides this kind of really perfect place for them to not be silenced and for them to be able to express opinions, thoughts, [and] feelings, about a whole range of things and to be exposed to new ideas that then enrich[es] them as well... [Y]ou can see that they are becoming a more full person.

A key ingredient for healing and wellness for the ES teachers was to provide multiple opportunities for students to find their voice, express their views, and be exposed to new critical information that enabled students to become more whole. This connects to tenet three of Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy because through this tenet teachers create a space where students' everyday lives, experiences, worldviews, and languages are honored and respected. In other words, teachers create a "homeplace" (Love, 2019) where students' whole selves can grow, develop and (re)ignite.

Many participants tailored their lessons to reflect their students' ways of knowing. Additionally, they adapted to and engaged with their students in critical thought and dialogue to help to foster a safe space which celebrated their students' and communities' strengths. Teachers cited various examples of supporting their students' lived realities of dealing with ICE raids, deportation, poverty, homelessness, food deserts, and mental health issues while tackling these difficult issues with grace and passion.

#### Classroom rituals

And how this is supposed to be a transformative process? We're supposed to become better as the result of taking this class. And we take out all [the posts with negative comments]. We all sign the pledge. And then we take out all those post-its and we burn them. (Myra, Chicana, ES Teacher)

Another key finding was how teachers promoted classroom rituals to encourage practices of healing and wellness. While being culturally sensitive and appropriate, several teachers utilized smudging as a healing practice to help students cleanse their negative energy. Smudging is a widely used Indigenous based ritual that is meant to cleanse a person by burning an herb like sage or sweetgrass while the smoke spreads around a person's body. While smudging is specific to our region in the Southwest and various cultures present in this region utilize it, it is also a practice that many cultures have performed for hundreds of years (Avery, 2019). Avery further explains that the art of burning herbs has aromatic, calming, cleansing, meditative and spiritual power that promotes healing and wellness. Smudging for the students and teachers emphasized the spiritual connectedness that helped to promote healing and wellness. Jonathan summarized, "And there was a couple of times when kids [were] like, 'I feel like I need to do some smudging,' and I would let them." The practice of smudging demonstrates how Indigenous-based practices can be adopted seamlessly into the classroom.

In another example, a few teachers had students do a burning exercise. In this exercise, students wrote down negative words or thoughts that were bothering them. Next, the teachers took these notes, and burned them as a way to release the negative energy. Additionally, Jonathan shared an example of a student who was struggling with their sexual identity and was having suicidal thoughts. Together they combined smudging and burning and created their own healing ceremony. Jonathan said, "[W]e were talking about some pretty hard stuff, but those moments like when we do things like [burning] was [when] I noticed that it was more uplifting to them." In the aforementioned, the student called upon their teacher for support. Even though they had a difficult time communicating with their parents, they were still able to let out their frustrations within the safe space of the classroom and perform their own healing ceremony with their trusted teacher.

Through these various rituals, teachers were able to utilize their pedagogy to help their students reframe ES curriculum within the lens of hope, healing and wellness. Jonathan explained how before he began teaching ES, he was more focused on what he had to teach or topics he had to cover. However, when he started teaching ES, he began looking for new opportunities to teach students holistically and utilized classroom rituals such as burning and smudging to promote healing and wellness.

Several ES teachers began to align their ES pedagogies with what Romero et al.'s (2009) call for in embracing Indigenous epistemologies and highlighting spaces of authentic care. These techniques are relevant to tenet six of *Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy* because they espouse the body/mind/spirit paradigm that focuses on holistic teaching. In other words, *Body-Soul* 

Rooted Pedagogy utilizes "mind/body/spirit interconnectedness as healing strength for ongoing wounds and urges educators across identity to ground themselves within epistemologies of survivance to reclaim well-being" (Sosa-Provencia et al., 2018, p. 11). When ES teachers consider the spiritual well-being of their students, it opens up opportunities for practices of healing and wellness that can be rooted in Indigenous epistemologies and alternative models of healing.

#### Social action

And so you have those "aha" moments in your classroom ... -it's really transformative for them because now, that same student, she wants to be involved in changing the world. She wants to be involved in changing the way things are and she's motivated to join community organizations and get involved in activism and being involved in participatory politics. (Adrian)

The last key practice of promoting healing and wellness was to engage students in social action. As discussed earlier, immigration has been a hotly contested issue for students. Jaime, a veteran Chicano teacher, discussed how the uncertainty of DACA and ICE raids created an environment of fear. In order to combat this fear, he as well as other teachers in this study supported student protests. By no means are we saying that this is the only way to protest, but it is important to acknowledge how teachers can assist students in engaging in social action.

When the DACA protests occurred nearly two years ago, several ES teachers supported and aided their students as they organized walkouts and protests. They utilized their classroom space to discuss these important topics and strategized with students on how they could make their voices heard. In this sense, the community centered practices of ES worked in concert with community and student organizing. Jaime discussed how on a monthly basis he worked with his students to organize protests regarding DACA. "Sometimes it's three of us, sometimes it's 15. But if only three show, we still go picket," said Jaime. The deeper message for students modeled through Jaime's behavior is that their voices matter and by engaging in social action transformational change is possible.

In another example, Monica proudly expounded on one of her student's successful efforts to organize district-wide walkouts protesting standardized testing. She shared how a discussion of the historic Chicano/a walkouts in East Los Angeles lead to real life social action. Building from the history of the Civil Rights movement, the ES class discussed how the Partnership for Assessment of Readiness for College and Careers (PARCC) test was unfair and how it was a multi-million dollar operation that did not serve students and their communities. One student remarked, "Well, how come we don't have a walkout?" to which Monica replied, "Well, how come we don't?"

This question motivated her student to utilize social media to organize student protests. Soon a "massive walkout" ensued all because of a conversation in class where an ES teacher helped a student connect the past to present and sparked social action.

Both of these examples connect to tenet five of *Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy*, which prepares youth to deconstruct power, privilege and oppression, while also, challenging students to take action in order to create social change. For ES teachers in our study, the critical conversations and topics that were examined lead to further exploration and action of their students with goals of social action in mind. Through this process, students became empowered, exerted their voices, and fought against injustices that impacted their well-being.

In short, ES teachers provided multiple opportunities for their students to engage in practices that promoted healing and wellness by not only creating safe, healing spaces where students articulated their lived realities, but by also providing opportunities to strategize on how they could create social change. These various ES teaching practices can promote strategies of resistance and student empowerment (Sleeter, 2011), create positive, safe spaces for students (de los Ríos, 2013), and can support students' cultural and socio-political identities, while raising learners' critical consciousness (Cammarota & Romero, 2014).

#### **Conclusion**

As demonstrated in the results, a major finding was that ES teachers utilized various strategies in the classroom to address the macro and micro traumas that their students experienced in their daily lives. The best practices from the successful implementation of ES included: utilizing decolonizing frameworks, engaging in community-based practices, and the ability to foster positive racial/ethnic identity (Tintiangco-Cubales et al., 2015). These strategies showcase the multifaceted ways in which high school ES teachers have the potential to address the lived realities of their diverse student populations through humanizing practices of healing and wellness. The framework of *Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy* (Sosa-Provencia et al., 2018) allows for the promotion of a decolonizing pedagogy that deconstructs, redefines, and explores the complex lived realities, intersectional identities, intellectual legacies, complexities of spirituality, and acknowledges Indigenous based practices of healing and wellness. These practices allow for a complex and humanizing space in which these multiple facets can interplay to bring about social change and resistance.

The year 2019 marked the 50th anniversary of the Third World Liberation Front's (TWLF) demand for ethnic studies at San Francisco State University (Meraji, 2019). Decades later, our findings highlight how

ES teachers' impassioned statements still echo the demands of TWLF students: an education that reflected their own lived experiences, identities, cultures, and histories. We further argue that ES classroom practices are political acts of resistance against the myriad of oppressive structures and systems that affect the everyday realities of our students. More importantly, these teachers created classroom spaces for practices of healing and wellness which can ultimately generate hope. Finally, through this study, we highlighted and celebrated multiple ES classroom triumphs through the form of "Aha" moments. Myra, a veteran Chicana ES teacher, boldly stated that the goals of her classroom were to, "creat[e] hope, showing them [her students] that this isn't the end. This isn't the be all and end all. We're creating hope by getting out there and investing in our communities ... " Our research seeks to continue this powerful sentiment and encourage the widespread use of ES as a powerful transformational pedagogical tool and to encourage a more holistic learning environment for all our students.

#### Limitations

We recognize that there were limitations to this study. First, due to time and financial constraints, we only had access to one school district in the Southwest. Additionally, this was the first year that ES was launched district wide, so there was only a small sample size of ES teachers available. Additionally, participants were limited to teachers only and direct student voice was restricted. Furthermore, participants were further reduced due to scheduling conflicts and time of year. For example, focus group participation was higher during the school year due to it being paired with professional development throughout the year, whereas individual interviews were scheduled during summer, which potentially conflicted with the start of the academic year. Lastly, research at this site is ongoing and future plans for additional follow-up interviews to address these gaps are in progress.

# **Significance**

This study is significant because it addresses a key gap in the literature by illustrating how ES teachers can create environments that foster practices of healing and wellness by utilizing Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy. By centering decolonizing pedagogies and utilizing counterstorytelling, ES teachers focus on the histories of their students and highlight and legitimize their lived experiences. By centering healing and wellness, ES teachers can generate hope in their classrooms and create learning environments to facilitate a more humanizing educational experience for all our students.

This past year has taught us that we must be able to reimagine education. For some teachers, it was a real struggle to engage students and facilitate a learning community. They had a difficult time helping their students grapple with the massive deaths caused by COVID-19, the social unrest caused by the killings of Ahmaud Arbery, Breonna Taylor, and George Floyd, and the grave uncertainties of shelter and food caused by the economic downturn. For others, it was an opportunity to critically reflect on their practice and to prioritize student well-being, build on students' lived experiences, and understand the importance of creating community. Thus, the promise of ES teachers who employ *Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy* is that they understood the importance of empowering students to reflect on these experiences and fostering pedagogies that privileged healing and wellness, which reimagined education as a tool for liberation and freedom.

#### **Notes**

- Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy is purposedly italicized throughout the paper to emphasize the rootedness in body/mind/soul.
- 2. Pseudonyms are used throughout the paper to protect the identity of participants.
- 3. We purposely use they/their pronouns to protect the identity of students when teachers discuss or share stories about individual students.

## **Funding**

This work was supported by the National Institute of Health (NIH)-National Institute of Minority Health & Health Disparities (NIMHD) (U54 MD004811-06), and The UNM Transdisciplinary Research, Equity and Engagement (TREE) Center for Advancing Behavioral Health.

#### **Notes on contributors**

*Shiv R. Desai* is working with scholars across diverse methodological, disciplinary, geographic, and social identities to examine whether high school ethnic studies can reduce educational inequities through the study of three districts. His previous research examined how Youth Participatory Action Research empowered system-involved youth to engage in justice reform and advocacy.

Andrea "Dre" Abeita, Coyote Walking, and real-life Isleta Pueblo Superhero is an Indigenous, two-spirited, bisexual, multiple-trauma survivor, PTSD-diagnosed, medical marijuana researcher/advocate and critical race theory, whiteness, and intersectional activist/scholar. Dre is currently a 9th year doctoral candidate at the University of New Mexico and the Chair of the AERA GSC.

Myrella R. Gonzalez graduated from the University of New Mexico with a B.S. in Population Health in May 2020. Myrella is currently a dual degree student at UCLA pursuing a Masters in Public Health and a Masters of Social Welfare. Myrella's areas of concentration include Community Health Education and Social Justice.



#### References

- Acosta, C. (2007). Developing critical consciousness: Resistance literature in a Chicano literature class. The English Journal, 97(2), 36-42.
- Acosta, C. (2014). Huitzilopochtli: The will and resiliency of Tucson youth to keep Mexican American studies alive. Multicultural Perspectives, 16(1), 3-7. https://doi.org/10. 1080/15210960.2013.867239
- Alejo, L. A., Lara, J. (2018, August 14). Ethnic studies should be a high school requirement. EdSource. https://edsource.org/2018/ethnic-studies-should-be-a-high-school-requirement/ 601244
- Arce, M. S. (2016). Xicana/o indigenous epistemologies: Toward a decolonizing and liberatory education for Xicana/o youth. In D. M. Sandoval, A. J. Ratcliff, T. L. Buenavista, & J. R. Marin (Eds.), "White" washing American education: The new culture wars in ethnic studies (pp. 11-43). Praeger.
- Asmelash, L. (2021, March 22). After years of debate, California finally adopts ethnic studies model curriculum. CNN. https://www.cnn.com/2021/03/22/us/california-ethnic-studieshigh-school-trnd/index.html
- Avery, A. (2019, November 28). The ancient art of smoke cleansing. Medium. https:// medium.com/sweetwitch/the-ancient-art-of-smoke-cleansing-an-interview-with-a-scottish-smudge-maker-6d97f37af899
- Borrero, N. (2019, Winter). Ethnic studies in San Francisco high schools: A model for the U.S.? University of San Francisco: CRASE. https://www.usfca.edu/journal/crase/brightfuture-or-cautionary-tale-how-the-bay-area-shapes-the-future-of-the-us-11
- Brave Heart, M. Y. H. (1999). Ovate Ptayela: Rebuilding the Lakota Nation through addressing historical trauma among Lakota parents. Journal of Human Behavior in the Social Environment, 2(1-2), 109-126. https://doi.org/10.1300/J137v02n01\_08
- Buenavista, T. L. (2016). "White" washing American education: The new culture wars in ethnic studies. In J. R. Sandoval, D. M. Ratcliff, A. J. Buenavista, & T. L. Marin (Eds.), "White" washing American education: The new culture wars in ethnic studies (pp. vii-xvii). Praeger.
- Cabrera, N. L., Meza, E. L., Romero, A. J., & Cintli Rodríguez, R. (2013). "If there is no struggle, there is no progress": Transformative youth activism and the school of ethnic studies. The Urban Review, 45(1), 7-22. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11256-012-0220-7
- Cabrera, N. L., Milem, J. F., Jaquette, O., & Marx, R. W. (2014). Missing the (student achievement) forest for all the (political) trees: Empiricism and the Mexican American studies controversy in Tucson. American Educational Research Journal, 51(6), 1084-1118. https://doi.org/10.3102/0002831214553705
- Cammarota, J., & Romero, A. (2014). Raza studies: The public option for educational revolution. The University of Arizona Press.
- Cammarota, J., & Romero, A. F. (2009). A social justice epistemology and pedagogy for Latina/o students: Transforming public education with participatory action research. New Directions for Youth Development, 2009(123), 53-65. https://doi.org/10.1002/yd.314
- de los Ríos, C. V. (2013). A curriculum of the borderlands: High school Chicana/o-Latina/o studies as sitios y lengua. The Urban Review, 45(1), 58-73. https://doi.org/10.1007/ s11256-012-0224-3
- de los Ríos, C. V. (2017). Picturing ethnic studies: Photovoice and youth literacies of social action. Journal of Adolescent & Adult Literacy, 61(1), 15-24. https://doi.org/10. 1002/jaal.631



- de los Ríos, C. V., López, J., & Morrell, E. (2015). Toward a critical pedagogy of race: Ethnic studies and literacies of power in high school classrooms. Race and Social Problems, 7(1), 84–96. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12552-014-9142-1
- Dee, T. S., & Penner, E. K. (2017). The causal effects of cultural relevance. American Educational Research Journal, 54(1), 127-166. https://doi.org/10.3102/0002831216677002
- Depenbrock, J. (2017, August 22). Federal judge finds racism behind Arizona law banning ethnic studies. National Public Radio. https://www.npr.org/sections/ed/2017/08/22/ 545402866/federal-judge-finds-racism-behind-arizona-law-banning-ethnic-studies
- Desai, S. R., Secatero, S., Sosa-Provencia, M. A., & Sheahan, A. (2019). Nourishing resistance and healing in dark times: Teaching through a Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy. In L. Tett & M. Hamilton (Eds.), Resisting neoliberalism in education: Local, national, and transnational perspectives (pp. 103-117). The Policy Press.
- Freire, P. (2000). *Pedagogy of the oppressed* (30th ed.). Bloomsbury.
- Grosfoguel, R. (2012). The dilemmas of ethnic studies in the United States: Between liberal multiculturalism, identity politics, disciplinary colonization, and decolonial epistemologies. Human Architecture, 10(1), 81. http://libproxy.unm.edu/login?url=https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=edsgao&AN=edsgcl.276353179&site=eds-live& scope=site
- Hannah-Jones, N. (2019, August 19). Our democracy's founding ideals were false when they were written: Black Americans have fought to make them true. New York Times https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2019/08/14/magazine/black-historyamerican-democracy.html
- Hoang, Q. (2012). Ethnic studies: The cyclical fight, conquer, and struggle. Vermont Connection, 33, 59-66. http://libproxy.unm.edu/login?url=https://search.ebscohost.com/ login.aspx?direct=true&db=ehh&AN=101367183&site=eds-live&scope=site
- Huberman, A. M., & Miles, M. B. (1998). Data management and analysis methods. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), Collecting and interpreting qualitative materials (pp. 125-135). Routledge.
- Kim, R. H. (2013). "Never knew literacy could get at my soul": On how words matter for youth, or notes toward decolonizing literacy. Review of Education, Pedagogy, and Cultural Studies, 35(5), 392-407. https://doi.org/10.1080/10714413.2013.842868
- Korte, L. (2020, April 17). Texas panel approves African American studies course. Statesman. https://www.statesman.com/news/20200417/texas-panel-approves-africanamerican-studies-course.
- Ladson-Billings, G. (2014). Culturally relevant pedagogy 2.0: a.k.a. the remix. Harvard Educational Review, 84(1), 74-85. https://doi.org/10.17763/haer.84.1.p2rj131485484751
- Love, B. L. (2019). We want to do more than survive: Abolitionist teaching and the pursuit of educational freedom. Beacon Press.
- McCarty, T., & Lee, T. S. (2014). Critical culturally sustaining/revitalizing pedagogy and Indigenous educational sovereignty. Harvard Educational Review, 84(1), 101-124. https:// doi.org/10.17763/haer.84.1.q83746nl5pj34216
- Meraji, S. M. (2019). 50 years ago students shut down this college to demand ethnic studies courses. https://www.npr.org/2019/03/21/705594577/50-years-ago-students-shut-downthis-college-to-demand-ethnic-studies-courses
- Merriam, S. (2009). Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation. Jossey-Bass. Oropeza, M. R. (2002). Community, culture and globalization. In D. Goldbard & A. Adams (Eds.), Community, culture and globalization (pp. 31-50). The Rockefeller Foundation.



- Paris, D., & Alim, H. S. (2014). What are we seeking to sustain through culturally sustaining pedagogy? A loving critique forward. Harvard Educational Review, 84(1), 85-100. https://doi.org/10.17763/haer.84.1.982l873k2ht16m77
- Reyes, K. B., & Curry Rodríguez, J. E. (2012). Testimonio: Origins, terms, and resources. Equity & Excellence in Education, 45(3), 525-538. https://doi.org/10.1080/10665684.2012. 698571
- Romero, A., Arce, S., & Cammarota, J. (2009). A Barrio pedagogy: Identity, intellectualism, activism, and academic achievement through the evolution of critically compassionate intellectualism. Race Ethnicity and Education, 12(2), 217-233. https://doi.org/10.1080/ 13613320902995483
- Salinas, L. S. (2011). Arizona's desire to eliminate ethnic studies programs: A time to take the "pill" and to engage Latino students in critical education about their history. Harvard Latino Law Review, 14, 301-323. http://libproxy.unm.edu/login?url=https:// search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=a9h&AN=64493934&site=eds-live& scope=site
- Secatero, S. (2015). "The leadership tree": Our roots of Indigenous leadership and wellbeing in higher education. In A. F. Chavez & R. Minthorn (Eds.), Indigenous leadership in higher education (pp. 114-127). Routledge Publishing.
- Sleeter, C. E. (2011). The academic and social value of ethnic studies: A research review. National Education Association Research Department. http://eric.ed.gov/?id= ED521869
- Smith, A. (2020, August 17). Gov. Newsom signs bill making ethnic studies course a requirement at California State University. EdSource. https://edsource.org/2020/gov-newsomsigns-assembly-bill-1460-requiring-ethnic-studies-at-csu/638506.
- Sosa-Provencia, M. A., Sheahan, A., Desai, S. R., & Secatero, S. (2018). Tenets of Body-Soul Rooted Pedagogy: Teaching for critical consciousness, nourished resistance, and healing. Critical Studies in Education, 63(1):345-362. https://doi.org/10.1080/17508487.2018. 1445653
- Stake, R. (1995). The art of case study research (pp. 49–68). SAGE.
- Tintiangco-Cubales, A., Kohli, R., Sacramento, J., Henning, N., Agarwal-Rangnath, R., & Sleeter, C. (2015). Toward an ethnic studies pedagogy: Implications for K-12 schools from the research. The Urban Review, 47(1), 104-125. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11256-014-0280-y
- Tuck, E., & Yang, K. W. (2018). Born under the rising sign of social justice. In E. Tuck & K. W. Yang (Eds.), Toward what justice?: Describing diverse dreams of justice in education (pp. 1-18). Routledge.
- Vizenor, G. (2008). Survivance: Narratives of Native presence (G. Vizenor, Ed.). University of Nebraska Press.
- Watson-Vandiver, M. J., & Wiggan, G. (2018). The genius of Imhotep: An exploration of African-centered curricula and teaching in a high achieving US Urban school. Teaching and Teacher Education, 76, 151-164. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2018.09.001